



100 John West Way
Aurora, Ontario
L4G 6J1
(905) 727-3123
aurora.ca

Town of Aurora

General Committee Report

No. PDS20-60

Subject: Heritage Designation for 28 Wellington Street West
("Alfred Love House")

Prepared by: Carlson Tsang, Planner/Heritage Planning

Department: Planning and Development Services

Date: October 20, 2020

Recommendation

1. That Report No. PDS20-60 be received; and
2. That the property at 28 Wellington Street, where the building known as "Alfred Love House", is located be designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as a property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest; and
3. That the Town Clerk be authorized to publish and serve Council's Notice of Intention to Designate in accordance with the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act*; and
4. That the designation by-law be brought before Council for adoption if no objections are received within the thirty (30) day period as per the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Executive Summary

The purpose of this report is to provide General Committee with the necessary information to support the designation of 28 Wellington Street West as a Property of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest under Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

- The Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER) prepared by the owner's Heritage Consultant concludes that the property meets the prescribed criteria in O. Reg. 09/06 for heritage designation.

- The Heritage Advisory Committee's Working Group is of the opinion that the property is in the 'Group 1' category, suggesting that it is of major significance and worthy of heritage designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Background

Property Description

28 Wellington Street West is located at the northeast corner of Machell Avenue and Wellington Street West, approximately 130 m (426.5 ft) west of Yonge Street (see Attachment 1). The property is listed on the Town's Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. There is a two-storey residence on the property known as "The Alfred Love House" constructed circa 1883. Vehicular access from Wellington Street is provided via a shared driveway with the property immediately to the east.

History of the Property

In 1797, the Crown granted 210 acres of land on Concession 1, Lot 81 in King Township (the lands located west of Yonge Street) to Thomas Philips. The lands were later sold to a local mill owner and farmer named Jacob Hollingshead. In 1853, the R.P. Irwin purchased the lands from the Hollingshead family and began to subdivide the lands into smaller lots, which created the subject property. In 1881, the property was purchased by Alfred Love who was a teacher in the local community.

Biographical records and source material suggests that Love built the house that currently exists on the property in 1883. The house was constructed in the Second Empire Style which grew in popularity in Canada starting in the 1870s. Love later left the teaching profession and began work as a book-keeper for the Fleury Foundry located across the street from his new home on Wellington Street. Love continued to work for the foundry for a decade before again changing careers and becoming a real estate agent and an insurance agent around 1890.

Love later became increasingly involved in the community and Town life. He served on Town Council for one year in 1893, and then as the Trustee for the local high school. He was also appointed a Justice of the Peace or Magistrate in 1896, in addition to duties as an assessor and collector for the Town's taxes. Love was noted in a county biographical record published in 1907 for his superb career as a public servant. In his final years, he

served as secretary of the public school board until 1941. Loved died in 1943 at the age of 94. Upon the death of Love's eldest daughter in 1951, the property was sold outside the family. A plaque was added to the front of the house around 1984 which named it "Alfred Love House".

The property was then owned by Margaret Proctor for a decade before selling it to Hazel Kennedy in 1961. Kennedy sold the property to Edward and Dorothy Kavanagh in 1978, who then sold it two years later to Adrienne Cameron in 1980. At some point during this time, the house was converted to a duplex between the first and second floor. In 1999, the property was purchased by the current owner, Lois Creelman, who has maintained the property as a duplex rented to tenants.

Architectural Features and Setting

The Alfred Love House is one of the very few dwellings in Aurora of the Second Empire architectural style characterized by a square massing and a mansard roof with slightly sloped upper sections and lower steeply pitched sections on both the main house and rear wing. The main house is supported by a fieldstone foundation with a central masonry wall. The exterior wall is clad with a yellow/buff brick on the south and west elevation, and a painted shiplap wood siding on the north and east elevation.

The front façade features a central gable roof above a semi-circular brick door opening with decorative wood trim and semi-circular transom with wood shutter. The east elevation contains a brick chimney which was at some point cut down in height and repaired with new brick and metal cap. With the exception of the basement windows, the original masonry openings with both flat and arched brick lintels on the ground floor remain intact. There are several dormer windows complete with decorative wood window surrounds.

The house is surrounded by generous lawns and is elevated from the public road with views overlooking Wellington Street. There are currently dense trees along the west property line that obscure the visibility of the house from Machell Avenue. The property is built with a stone retaining wall fronting Wellington Street and Machell Avenue. A concrete stair with metal handrail is located at the front to provide access to the property from the sidewalk.

Ontario Heritage Act

28 Wellington Street West is currently a non-designated property listed on the Town's Heritage Register. The *Ontario Heritage Act* enables municipalities to pass a by-law to individually designate a property of cultural heritage value or interest. Individual properties being considered for heritage designation must meet one or more of the prescribed criteria from the O. Reg. 9/06, with respect to design or physical value; historical or associative value; and contextual value.

Provincial Policy Statement (2020)

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest. The PPS identifies that significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved. Built heritage resource is defined in the PPS as a building, structure, monument, installation or any manufactured remnant that contributes to a property's cultural heritage value or interest as identified by a community; and they are generally located on a property that has been designated under Part IV or V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, or included on local, provincial and/or federal registers.

York Region and Town of Aurora Official Plans

The York Region Official Plan encourages local municipalities to compile and maintain a register of significant cultural heritage resources, in consultation with heritage experts and local heritage committees. It requires local municipalities to conserve significant cultural heritage resources and ensure that development and site alteration of adjacent lands to protected heritage properties will conserve the attributes of the protected heritage property. The Town's Official Plan states that all significant heritage resources shall be designated as being of cultural heritage value or interest in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act* to ensure effective protection and their continuing maintenance, conservation and restoration.

Analysis

The Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER) prepared by the owner's Heritage Consultant concludes that the property meets the prescribed criteria from O. Reg. 09/06 for heritage designation.

The owner retained Stevens Burgess Architects Ltd. (SBA) to prepare a Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER) to assess the heritage value of the subject property (see Attachment 2). The report concludes that the subject property meets the criteria for heritage designation under Ontario Regulation 09/06 based on the design and contextual association for its exterior elements and setting. Below is a summary of the comments in the CHER:

Design or Physical Value

The house is one of five remaining examples of the Second Empire Style of architectural design in the Town of Aurora. It is arguably one of the finest due to its location along a prominent street and its large lawn that surrounds the house (both key characteristics of the Second Empire Style).

Historical or Associated Value

The building has historical association with Alfred Love, a well-known public servant who made considerable contribution to the local community. Love served on Town Council for one year in 1893, and then as the Trustee for a local high school. He was also appointed a Justice of the Peace or Magistrate in 1896 and work for the Town in this capacity well into the 20th Century. He also performed duties as an assessor and collector for the Town's taxes and Secretary of the Public School Board.

Contextual Value

The property supports the historical character of this neighborhood within the "Old Town" of the Aurora Promenade. The house was constructed in 1883 and is one of the remaining houses in the residential neighborhoods that surround the main street. At one time, the house could conceivably have been a landmark due to its proximity to the commercial main street as well as its setting above Wellington Street, the major east-west thoroughfare in Aurora.

The CHER recommends the following attributes be listed in the Designation By-law should the property become designated:

- Overall massing with main house and rear wing;
- Fieldstone foundations of the main house;
- Exterior yellow/buff brick walls with original mortar;
- Arched and flat brick lintels and masonry openings;
- Brick chimney (modified);
- Mansard roofs with slightly sloped upper sections and lower steeply pitched sections on both the main house and rear wing;
- Central brick gable on the front elevation inclusive of round arched 2nd floor brick opening and decorative wood trim (similar to dormer window wood surrounds) at the sides;
- Dormer windows (windows themselves are not original) complete with decorative wood window surrounds (somewhat buttress-like shaped boards);
- Front entrance wood screen door and inner wood door with double arched glazed openings in the upper half with solid wood panels below. Original hardware inclusive of rim/box locks, ceramic knobs and decorative hinges;
- Second floor wood door with double arched glazed openings in the upper half with solid wood panels below. Original hardware inclusive of rim/box locks, ceramic knobs and decorative hinges;
- Glazed semi-circular transom above second floor door complete with semi-circular wood shutter (hardware if extant);
- The prominent height of the land with views to the site from Wellington Street and from the site to the east and west along Wellington Street;
- The location and setback of the house from Wellington Street; and
- The stone retaining wall and pedestrian access from Wellington Street.

The Heritage Advisory Committee's Working Group is of the opinion that the property is in the 'Group 1' category, suggesting that it is of major significance and worthy of heritage designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*

On August 12, 2020, the Heritage Advisory Committee's Evaluation Working Group met with Planning Staff to perform an evaluation of the subject property (see Attachment 3). The property scored 84.6/100. The score places the property in Group 1, which suggests that the property is of major significance and should be subject to the following protection measures according to the Town's criteria:

- The designation of the building pursuant to the *Ontario Heritage Act*;

- Every attempt must be made to preserve the building on its original site;
- Any development affecting such a building must incorporate the identified building;

Advisory Committee Review

The Heritage Advisory Committee reviewed the item on September 14, 2020. The Committee agreed with the results of the evaluation undertaken by the Working Group and the recommendation in the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report prepared by the applicant's consultant. The Committee was of the opinion that the Alfred Love House is an important part of the heritage character of the neighbourhood and expressed support for the heritage designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* for long-term protection.

Legal Considerations

If Council decides to proceed with designation, a notice of intention to designate will be served on the property owner, Ontario Heritage Trust, and published in the local newspaper. Once the Town issues a Notice of Intention to Designate, the property is protected under the *Ontario Heritage Act* as designated. Any person may object to the notice of intention to designate within 30 days of its publication. If there are no objections within the 30-day period, the designation by-law for the subject property will be brought forward to Council for approval. If there are objections, they will be referred to the Local Planning Appeal Tribunal for a hearing.

Financial Implications

There are no financial implications arising from this report.

Communications Considerations

The Town of Aurora will use 'Inform' as the level of engagement for this matter. There are five different levels of community engagement to consider, with each level providing the community more involvement in the decision making process. These levels are: Inform, Consult, Involve, Collaborate and Empower. Examples of each can be found in the Community Engagement Policy. These options are based on the International Association of Public Participation (IAP2) Spectrum and assist in establishing guidelines for clearly communicating with our public and managing community engagement. In

order to inform the public, this report will be posted to the Town's website, and the approval of the recommendations will authorize the Town Clerk to publish and serve Council's Notice of Intention to Designate in accordance with the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, including notice in the local newspaper.

Link to Strategic Plan

The conservation of heritage resources supports the Strategic Plan goal of ***Supporting an Exceptional Quality of Life for All*** through its accomplishment in satisfying requirements in objective ***Celebrating and Promoting our Culture***.

Alternative(s) to the Recommendation

1. That 15074 Yonge Street continue to be a listed (non-designated) property on the Aurora Registrar of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

Conclusions

Staff support the recommendations in the Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report prepared by the owner's consultant and the results of the evaluation undertaken by the Heritage Advisory Committee's Working Group. Staff are recommending that 28 Wellington Street West be designated under Section 29 (Part IV) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Attachments

Attachment 1 – Location Map

Attachment 2 – Cultural Heritage Evaluation Recommendation Report

Attachment 3 – Evaluation Working Group Score

Previous Reports

Heritage Advisory Committee Report HAC20-009 – 28 Wellington Street West

Pre-submission Review

Agenda Management Team review on October 1, 2020

Approvals

Approved by David Waters, Director, Planning and Development Services

Approved by Doug Nadorozny, Chief Administrative Officer