

100 John West Way Aurora, Ontario L4G 6J1 (905) 727-3123 aurora.ca

Town of Aurora **Heritage Advisory Committee**

No. HAC20-014

Subject: Request to Remove a Property from the Aurora Register of

Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

93 Tyler Street

Prepared by: Carlson Tsang, Planner/Heritage Planning

Department: Planning and Development Services

Date: November 2, 2020

Recommendation

1. That Report No. HAC20-014 be received; and

2. That the Heritage Advisory Committee comments regarding the delisting of 93 Tyler Street be received and referred to staff for consideration and action as appropriate.

Executive Summary

The purpose of this report is to provide the Heritage Advisory Committee with the necessary information for providing comments on the request to remove 93 Tyler Street from the Aurora Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

 The Heritage Advisory Committee's Working Group performed an evaluation of the property and concludes that the property is not worthy of heritage designation.

Background

Property Description

The subject property is located on the south side of Tyler Street, south of Wellington Street West and west of George Street (see Attachment 1). The property is listed on the Town's Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. There is a two-storey residence and a double-car detached garage on the property (see Attachment 2). Records show that the house was constructed in 1913. The architectural appearance of

the house can be described as a simplified version of the Classis Revival style, characterized by gable roofs with a bricked chimney, a verandah at the front façade, traditional sash windows with wooden shutters and a triple bay window on the east side wall. The building contains a rear addition constructed as early as the 1970's.

History of the Property

In 1912, George Case purchased the property as an investment and constructed a twostorey detached dwelling in 1913. The house was rented by a local tanner until the property was sold to the Town's constable named Duncan Cram in 1918. The property was subsequently purchased by Harriet Welsh, who was the widow of Israel Welsh from Whitchurch Township. Harriet Welsh moved to this neighborhood for her children, Harry and Verna, to attend the Aurora High School.

The Welsh family only lived in the house for a few years, but kept ownership of the property until 1946. Harry Welsh went on to become the chairman of the department of physics at the University of Toronto. For most of the time since Welshes' departure, the building has been a rental property. The building has been unoccupied for nearly ten years. The interior of the building is subject to severe deterioration.

Ontario Heritage Act

93 Tyler Street a non-designated property listed on the Town's Heritage Register. The principal implication of properties being listed is outlined in Section 27 (3) of the Ontario Heritage Act where owners are required to provide the Town at least 60 days' notice in writing of their intention to demolish or remove a building or structure on the property. This notice period allows Town Council to make informed decisions and consult with the Heritage Advisory Committee regarding whether or not the property requires designation under the Ontario Heritage Act for long-term protection.

Provincial Policy Statement (2020)

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest. The PPS identifies that significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved. Built heritage resource is defined in the PPS as a building, structure, monument, installation or any manufactured remnant that contributes to a property's cultural heritage value or interest as identified by a community; and they are generally located on a property that has been designated

under Part IV or V of the Ontario Heritage Act, or included on local, provincial and/or federal registers.

York Region and Town of Aurora Official Plans

The York Region Official Plan encourages local municipalities to compile and maintain a register of significant cultural heritage resources, in consultation with heritage experts and local heritage committees. It requires local municipalities to conserve significant cultural heritage resources and ensure that development and site alteration of adjacent lands to protected heritage properties will conserve the attributes of the protected heritage property.

The Town's Official Plan states that all significant heritage resources shall be designated as being of cultural heritage value or interest in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act* to ensure effective protection and their continuing maintenance, conservation and restoration.

Analysis

The Heritage Advisory Committee's Working Group performed an evaluation of the property and concludes that the property is not worthy of heritage designation.

On October 15th, 2020, the Heritage Advisory Committee's Evaluation Working Group met with Planning Staff to perform an evaluation of the subject property based on the criteria prescribed in Ontario Regulation 09/06 and the Town's Heritage Evaluation Guidelines (see Attachment 3). The property scored 40.4/100. The score places the property in Group 3, which suggests that the property is not worthy of heritage designation. Below is a summary of the comments from the Working Group:

- The exterior of the building does not exhibit any unique elements that represents a rare architectural style or construction method. The elevations do not display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.
- While the building is associated with Harry Welsh who was a renowned physicist
 and educator at the University of Toronto, Welsh only lived on the property for a
 brief period of time and therefore was not considered to be of significant
 importance to the local community.

 The building has limited contextual value due to its age which establishes limited symbolic significance as a historical residence. However, the building is not part of any historic grouping or distinctive setting. The building is not considered to be a heritage landmark in the local community.

Link to Strategic Plan

The conservation of heritage resources supports the Strategic Plan goal of **Supporting** an **Exceptional Quality of Life for All** through its accomplishment in satisfying requirements in objective **Celebrating and Promoting our Culture**.

Alternative(s) to the Recommendation

1. That the Heritage Advisory Committee provide direction.

Conclusions

The Heritage Advisory Committee's Working Group performed an evaluation of the existing building at 93 Tyler Street and concludes that it does not meet the criteria for heritage designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Staff recommend that 93 Tyler Street be removed from the Aurora Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

Attachments

Attachment 1 – Location Map

Attachment 2 - Photos of the building

Attachment 3 – Evaluation Working Group Score

Previous Reports

None.

Approvals

Approved by David Waters, Director of Planning and Development Services