



100 John West Way
Aurora, Ontario
L4G 6J1
(905) 727-3123
aurora.ca

Town of Aurora

General Committee Report

No. PDS20-074

Subject: Request to Remove a Property from the Aurora Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest
93 Tyler Street

Prepared by: Carlson Tsang, Planner/Heritage Planning

Department: Planning and Development Services

Date: November 17, 2020

Recommendation

1. That Report No. PDS20-074 be received; and,
2. That the listed property located at 93 Tyler Street be removed from the Aurora Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

Executive Summary

The purpose of this report is to provide the General Committee with the necessary information to support the delisting of 93 Tyler Street from the Aurora Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

- The Heritage Advisory Committee's Working Group performed an evaluation of the property and concludes that the property is not worthy of heritage designation.

Background

Property Description

The subject property is located on the south side of Tyler Street, south of Wellington Street West and west of George Street (see Attachment 1). The property is listed on the Town's Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest. There is a two-storey residence and a double-car detached garage on the property (see Attachment 2). Records show that the house was constructed in 1913. The architectural appearance of the house can be described as a simplified version of the Classic Revival style, characterized by gable roofs with a bricked chimney, a verandah at the front façade,

traditional sash windows with wooden shutters and a triple bay window on the east side wall. The building contains a rear addition constructed as early as the 1970's.

History of the Property

In 1912, George Case purchased the property as an investment and constructed a two-storey detached dwelling in 1913. The house was rented by a local tanner until the property was sold to the Town's constable named Duncan Cram in 1918. The property was subsequently purchased by Harriet Welsh, who was the widow of Israel Welsh from Whitchurch Township. Harriet Welsh moved to this neighborhood for her children, Harry and Verna, to attend Aurora High School.

The Welsh family only lived in the house for a few years, but kept ownership of the property until 1946. Harry Welsh went on to become the chairman of the department of physics at the University of Toronto. For most of the time since Welshes' departure, the building has been a rental property. The building has been unoccupied for nearly ten years. The interior of the building is subject to severe deterioration.

Ontario Heritage Act

93 Tyler Street is a non-designated property listed on the Town's Heritage Register. The principal implication of properties being listed is outlined in Section 27 (3) of the Ontario Heritage Act where owners are required to provide the Town at least 60 days' notice in writing of their intention to demolish or remove a building or structure on the property. This notice period allows Council to make informed decisions and consult with the Heritage Advisory Committee regarding whether or not the property requires designation under the Ontario Heritage Act for long-term protection.

Provincial Policy Statement (2020)

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides policy direction on matters of provincial interest. The PPS identifies that significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved. Built heritage resource is defined in the PPS as a building, structure, monument, installation or any manufactured remnant that contributes to a property's cultural heritage value or interest as identified by a community; and they are generally located on a property that has been designated under Part IV or V of the Ontario Heritage Act, or included on local, provincial and/or federal registers.

York Region and Town of Aurora Official Plans

The York Region Official Plan encourages local municipalities to compile and maintain a register of significant cultural heritage resources, in consultation with heritage experts and local heritage committees. It requires local municipalities to conserve significant cultural heritage resources and ensure that development and site alteration of adjacent lands to protected heritage properties will conserve the attributes of the protected heritage property.

The Town's Official Plan states that all significant heritage resources shall be designated as being of cultural heritage value or interest in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act* to ensure effective protection and their continuing maintenance, conservation and restoration.

Analysis

The Heritage Advisory Committee's Working Group performed an evaluation of the property and concludes that the property is not worthy of heritage designation.

On October 15th, 2020, the Heritage Advisory Committee's Evaluation Working Group met with Planning Staff to perform an evaluation of the subject property based on the criteria prescribed in Ontario Regulation 09/06 and the Town's Heritage Evaluation Guidelines (see Attachment 3). The property scored 40.4/100. The score places the property in Group 3, which suggests that the property is not worthy of heritage designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.

The following is a summary of the comments from the Working Group:

- The exterior of the building does not exhibit any unique elements that represents a rare architectural style or construction method. The elevations do not display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.
- While the building is associated with Harry Welsh who was a renowned physicist and educator at the University of Toronto, Welsh only lived on the property for a brief period of time and therefore was not considered to be of significant importance to the local community.
- The building has limited contextual value due to its age which establishes limited symbolic significance as a historical residence. However, the building is not part of

any historic grouping or distinctive setting. The building is not considered to be a heritage landmark in the local community.

Advisory Committee Review

The Heritage Advisory Committee reviewed the application at its meeting on November 2, 2020. The Committee discussed about the property's association with Harry Welsh who was a renowned physicist from the University of Toronto, and the building's relationship with the historic neighbourhood. Although the building has some level of contextual value, the Committee recognized that there is not enough evidence to suggest that the property meets the criteria for heritage designation.

The Committee noted that the building's interior is subject to severe deterioration as it has been vacant for many years. The Committee agreed with the results of the evaluation undertaken by the HAC Working group and supported the removal of 93 Tyler Street from the Aurora Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

Legal Considerations

None.

Financial Implications

There are no financial implications.

Communications Considerations

The Town of Aurora will use 'Inform' as the level of engagement for this matter. There are five different levels of community engagement to consider, with each level providing the community more involvement in the decision-making process. These levels are: Inform, Consult, Involve, Collaborate and Empower. Examples of each can be found in the Community Engagement Policy. These options are based on the International Association of Public Participation (IAP2) Spectrum and assist in establishing guidelines for clearly communicating with our public and managing community engagement. In order to inform the public, this report will be posted to the Town's website.

Link to Strategic Plan

The conservation of heritage resources supports the Strategic Plan goal of **Supporting an Exceptional Quality of Life for All** through its accomplishment in satisfying requirements in objective **Celebrating and Promoting our Culture**.

Alternative(s) to the Recommendation

1. That 93 Tyler Street continue to be a listed (non-designated) property on the Aurora Registrar of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

Conclusions

The Heritage Advisory Committee's Working Group performed an evaluation of the existing building at 93 Tyler Street and concludes that it does not meet the criteria for heritage designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Staff recommend that 93 Tyler Street be removed from the Aurora Register of Properties of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

Attachments

- Attachment 1 – Location Map
- Attachment 2 – Photos of the building
- Attachment 3 – Evaluation Working Group Score

Previous Reports

HAC20-014 – Delisting of 93 Tyler Street - November 2, 2020

Pre-submission Review

Reviewed by the Chief Administrative Officer and Director of Planning and Development Services

Approvals

Approved by David Waters, Director, Planning and Development Services

Approved by Doug Nadorozny, Chief Administrative Officer