



100 John West Way  
Aurora, Ontario  
L4G 6J1  
(905) 727-3123  
aurora.ca

Town of Aurora

## General Committee Report

No. PDS22-082

---

**Subject:** Heritage Permit Application File: HPA-2022-06  
20 Catherine Avenue

**Prepared by:** Brashanthe Manoharan, Planner/ Heritage Planning

**Department:** Planning and Development Services

**Date:** June 21, 2022

---

### Recommendation

1. That Report No. PDS22-082 be received; and
2. That Heritage Permit Application HPA-2022-06 be approved to permit a two-storey rear addition to the existing dwelling at 20 Catherine Avenue.

### Executive Summary

This report seeks Council's approval to the application for Heritage Permit Application HPA-2022-06. The purpose of the application is to replace the existing one and a half addition with a two-storey addition to the existing dwelling at 20 Catherine Avenue. The subject property is designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and is located within the Northeast Old Aurora Heritage Conservation District.

- Staff have no concerns with the proposal as the two-storey addition to the existing dwelling is not anticipated to adversely impact the character of the streetscape.
- Staff are satisfied that the proposal meets the design guidelines of the Northeast Old Aurora Heritage Conservation District Plan.

### Background

#### Property Description

The subject property is located on the north side of Catherine Avenue, north of Wellington Street East and east of Yonge Street (see Attachment 1). The existing house

(also known as the “Phillips House”) was constructed c1885 by Daniel A. Phillips. The house can be described as late 19<sup>th</sup> century two and a half (2 ½) storey Ell-shaped dwelling with Italianate and Gothic Revival style influences of the Victorian era. Features include decorative bargeboards, louvered wood shutters, double hung windows including segmental arched and round headed varieties.

The property contains a garage located in the northwest portion of the property. Parking is provided on the existing driveway located on the west side of the property. Mature vegetation exists on the property, which includes two (2) large trees in the front yard, two (2) large trees and a cedar hedge along the east side yard, two large trees located in the rear yard, and vegetation along the west and rear property line.

### **Heritage Designation**

In 2006, Town Council passed By-Law 4804-06.D to designate 20 Catherine Avenue under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as part of the Northeast Old Aurora Heritage Conservation District. Town Council also passed By-Law 4809-06.D to adopt the “Northeast Old Aurora Heritage Conservation District Plan” as the document to guide the preservation, redevelopment and alteration of the properties and streetscapes located within the boundaries of the District.

### **Heritage Permit Application**

The applicant has submitted a heritage permit to replace the existing one and a half storey addition with a 130.9 m<sup>2</sup> (1,410 ft<sup>2</sup>) two-storey addition to the existing dwelling. The proposed addition will be finished with vertical rough pawn siding in a buttercream colour, fibreglass Cambridge style driftwood or weatherwood colour to match existing, windows and doors in cream frames and trim, and is designed with gable roofs that is consistent in slope and style to the main building.

The proposed north elevation features a patio style door and windows that are similar in style to the existing windows. The proposed west elevation is designed with two (2) windows, and the proposed east elevation is designed with three (3) windows.

One (1) Manitoba Maple tree located in the rear yard is proposed to be removed to facilitate the proposed addition to the existing dwelling.

The applicants have obtained a Preliminary Zoning Review (dated April 11, 2022) that confirms that the proposed addition complies with the requirements of the Zoning By-law.

## Analysis

**Staff support the replacement of the existing one and a half storey addition with a two-storey rear addition as it will not adversely impact the heritage value of the property.**

The proposed two-storey addition will not adversely affect the heritage integrity of the existing dwelling as it is located entirely behind the main building. Further, the proposed rear addition is not visible from the streetscape. As such, there will be minimal impacts on the streetscape.

**Staff are satisfied that the proposed addition generally meets the design guidelines in the Northeast Old Aurora Heritage Conservation District Plan.**

As indicated in Section 9.1.2.5 of the District Plan, exterior additions are to be located at the rear or an inconspicuous side of the historic building. The proposed two-storey addition is located directly and entirely behind the existing dwelling. The proposed addition will not be visible from the street and will not adversely impact the streetscape. Further, the existing mature trees in the front yard, as well as the vegetation along the west and east property lines will provide further screening to mitigate any visual impacts to the streetscape.

Section 9.1.3 of the District Plan states that additions and alterations to an existing heritage building should be consistent with the style of the original buildings. Staff consider the overall design of the proposed addition to be compatible with the original architectural character of the main building. The proposed board and batten siding, asphalt shingles, and proposed windows are consistent with the guidelines of the Heritage District Plan.

Section 9.3 of the District Plan provides that new addition should not have a greater height or scale than the original building. The proposed two-storey addition does not exceed the peak height of the existing dwelling. Further, the floor area of the proposed addition is less than 20% of the footprint of the existing house.

The proposed vertical siding and shingles are considered appropriate materials as per Section 9.8.1 of the District Plan as they respect the integrity of the existing dwelling and context of the neighbourhood.

**Town Forestry Staff assessment confirms information in tree removal application and compensation requirements.**

On May 10, 2022, the Parks Division received a formal Tree Removal Application and supporting documentation for the removal of one (1), Manitoba Maple tree from the rear yard of the property.

Staff attended the site and confirm a Manitoba maple with a diameter at DBH of 71.5 cm is located in the rear yard along the property line. The tree is in poor to fair condition with a large open cavity approximately 5 meters above grade. This indicates that there was a second codominant branch that was removed or broke away from the tree at some point in time. Due to the size of the cavity the long-term health and structural integrity of the tree is compromised. Staff agree with the recommendation to remove the tree due the impacts of the construction and associated risks the tree poses to adjacent property.

In addition, a Scott's Pine on the property to be retained, as construction will have a minimal impact to the root zone. The report recommends utilizing a root reduction method which includes trenching just outside the foundation excavation to clearly identify roots and properly pruning impacted roots as per industry standard arboriculture practices to ensure tree health is not compromised.

As per the Town's Tree Removal Compensation Policy, the value of this tree \$350. Should the removal be approved staff will work with the applicant to fulfill the requirements of the compensation policy.

**Advisory Committee Review**

The Heritage Advisory Committee discussed Heritage Permit Application HPA-2022-06 at its meeting on June 6, 2022. The Committee expressed their support to the application as the proposal is located directly behind the dwelling and is compatible with the original architectural character of the dwelling. The Heritage Advisory Committee had no objection to the approval of HPA-2022-06.

**Legal Considerations**

Under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, any developments or alterations that would potentially impact the heritage character of a property located within a Heritage Conservation District requires Council's consent. This legislative requirement is implemented in the Town of Aurora through the process of a Heritage Permit

Application, which is subject to Council's approval in consultation with the Heritage Advisory Committee. Council must make a decision on a heritage permit application within 90 days after the notice of receipt is served on the applicant, otherwise Council shall be deemed to have consented to the application. The 90-day deadline for this permit application is July 18, 2022. Council may extend the review period of a heritage application in a heritage conservation district without any time limit under the *Ontario Heritage Act* provided it is agreed upon by the owner.

If Council refuses the application, the owner may appeal the refusal to the Ontario Land Tribunal.

## Financial Implications

There are no direct financial implications arising from this report.

## Communications Considerations

The Town will use 'Inform' as the level of engagement for this application. There are five different levels of community engagement to consider, with each level providing the community more involvement in the decision-making process. These levels are: Inform, Consult, Involve, Collaborate and Empower. Examples of each can be found in the Community Engagement Policy. These options are based on the International Association of Public Participation (IAP2) Spectrum and assist in establishing guidelines for clearly communicating with our public and managing community engagement. In order to inform the public, this report will be posted to the Town's website.

## Climate Change Considerations

The recommendations from this report does not impact greenhouse gas emissions or impact climate change adaptation.

## Link to Strategic Plan

The conservation of heritage resources supports the Strategic Plan goal of *Supporting an Exceptional Quality of Life for All* through its accomplishment in satisfying requirements in objective *Celebrating and Promoting our Culture*.

## **Alternative(s) to the Recommendation**

1. That Council approve the application with terms and conditions.
2. That Council refuse the Heritage Permit Application HPA-2022-06 with an explanation for the refusal.

## **Conclusions**

Staff have reviewed Heritage Permit Application HPA-2022-06 for 20 Catherine Avenue and are satisfied that the proposed work is consistent with the design guidelines of the Northeast Old Aurora Heritage Conservation District Plan. Staff recommend to Council that Heritage Permit Application HPA-2022-06 for 20 Catherine Street be approved.

## **Attachments**

Attachment 1 – Location Map

Attachment 2 - Drawings

## **Previous Reports**

Heritage Memorandum - Heritage Permit Application File: HPA-2022-06 – June 6, 2022

## **Pre-submission Review**

Agenda Management Team review on June 2, 2022

## **Approvals**

Approved by Marco Ramunno, Director, Planning and Development Services

Approved by Doug Nadorozny, Chief Administrative Officer